

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING  
July 8, 2014

**Meeting called to order** at 7:01 p.m. by Vice-Chairman Griffin

**Pledge of Allegiance**

**Invocation** – Commissioner Hansen

Commissioner Ducrou – Excused  
Commissioner Hansen – Present  
Commissioner Cook – Present  
Commissioner Griffin – Present  
Commissioner Klos – Present  
Chief Larry Nisbet - Present  
Office Manager - Theresa Sharp - Present  
Attorney Ian Mann – Absent

**Others Present:** Some Staff & Public

**Minutes** – Review and Acceptance of the minutes of the June 10, 2014 Board of Commissioners meeting. Motion made by Commissioner Klos to accept the minutes. Commissioner Hansen seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for questions or comments. With no questions or discussion and none opposed, motion carries.

**Financial Report** - Review & Acceptance of the June financials. Commissioner Cook moves to accept the June financials. Commissioner Klos seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for questions or comments. With no questions or discussion, and none opposed, motion carries.

**Fire Marshal and Administrative Reports** (attached) – Chief Nisbet states we have no Fire Marshal report as activities were minimal such as compliance with firewalls at Loves. He reads the Administrative Report into the record. Commissioner Griffin asks about the Firefighter layoffs; clarifying that the various departments in the county will lay off a total of 105 firefighters? Chief Nisbet confirms, adding that something like 60 or 63 are Lehigh Acres. Commissioner Griffin states, unless they get funding. Chief agrees, that is if we can't get funding, and SAFER, every indication is that the application period is not going to open up until fall. After application period, you're looking at another 90-120 days before they start doing awards, once they get through the process. Engineer Lemieux states it's 60 in Lehigh, 20 in Ft. Myers... Chief Nisbet adds 10 in Tice...Commissioner Griffin states actually 21 in Ft. Myers. Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for any other questions or comments. With no further discussion or questions, Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for Petitions.

**Petitions before the Board/Public Input** – Chair calls Jason Snyder. He introduces himself and has manila envelopes for each Board Member. Commissioner Cook asks him if he's going to read it. He replies whatever they like, but it is 5 pages long. He apologizes, but thought he would wait until after the assessment vote, so things might be a little quieter; but apparently by the turn out tonight, that's not the case. He offers they can read

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

it in their own time and get back with him. Commissioner Cook states that would probably be the best thing. Chair calls Steve Brodtkin who prefers to wait until later in session.

**Union Petitions/Discussions – None**

**Old Business –**

- **AFG Grant Application** – Chief Nisbet states we have some indication that we may be receiving the AFG Grant for some major capital items we had discussed last fall that would be required in the near future. One of those major expenses was air packs, so Chief had put in a grant application for 18 air packs, some spare bottles, masks, and also the diesel emission system. He states it looks like we could see the potential of seeing that award, either on one side or the other, or possibly both. He has looked at our budget on the grant application and they have zeroed out the diesel emissions section on it, but they have left the air pack costs in tact. So he believes they are going to give us the grant for that portion of the grant that is for the air packs. He has been trying to get a hold of someone up there, but with the holiday, it would appear there are a lot of vacations going on. The grant is for \$123,526 our exposure is \$6,176 which Chief believes he will be able to take care of with the trade-ins of the existing air packs, which will no longer be compliant, but will be good enough to go to a third world country. So he is asking the Board to authorize him to accept the award if it should come through. Commissioner Klos asks if we can try to trade the airpacks to the academy for training. He has heard that has been done before. They give you some sort of a credit for the airpacks toward training because they always need those there. Chief Nisbet states he doesn't have a problem with that but notes the application was made at the prices last year, so the cost might be a little bit higher. If it is, he would like to off set some of those costs with the trade-ins. But if we can do it to where that's not going to be the case, they would be good air packs for the academy. He requests permission to accept the grant, and we can postpone the decision of what to do with the trade-ins. He hopes to know by next meeting. Commissioner Cook motions we accept the grant if it is awarded. Commissioner Klos seconds the motion. With none opposed, motion passed unanimously. With no further questions or comments Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for any other old business. Hearing none he calls for New Business.

**New Business –**

- **Schedule Tentative Budget Hearing and Preliminary Maximum Millage Rate.** Chief Nisbet states that of course, with the Fire Assessment not passing, we will need to keep the millage rate at its current rate. The calendars are provided reflecting the BOCC and School Boards dates which we are to avoid. September 16<sup>th</sup> at 7:00pm is the proposed Tentative Budget Hearing date with the regular monthly to immediately follow, and the 30<sup>th</sup> is proposed for the final Budget Hearing, also at 7:00pm. – The Board is all in agreement for the dates and request is made for a motion for the maximum millage rate. Commissioner Cook moves to set the maximum millage rate at 3.5000 and to use September 16<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> as the tentative and final hearings. Commissioners Klos and Hansen second the motion in unison. Motion passed unanimously. With no other new business, Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for Public Input.

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING  
July 8, 2014

**Public Input** – Chair calls Steve Brodtkin – Begins by stating he is a little bit confused; if he remembers correctly, we had voted last meeting to bring the referendum back for vote in the November elections, if it failed. He continues; I don't know if that's still the plan, or if that's going to be discussed tonight. Is that the plan? Is this coming back in November? Commissioner Cook responds that is what we talked about, and we said we are going to do it. Commissioner Griffin and Chief Nisbet both respond to the affirmative that is our intent. Chief states he was leaving that to the Board to direct whether they wish to re-address that based upon the results. Office Manager states we have submitted our resolution to the Supervisor of elections, preserving our ability to pursue that, should that still be the Board's desire now that results are in. Commissioner Griffin states he thought that was what the Board had voted and decided. Office Manager states that is our direction at this point; unless we receive other direction from the Board that is where we are headed. Commissioner Hansen states we had voted on it and everything, but he was thinking it would be a lot closer vote than it was. Mr. Brodtkin resumes, that his understanding from what he heard a month ago was that the Board was planning on bringing back the referendum with the same methodology; and what he has heard from the general public, that was one of the big problems a lot of people talked about, was the methodology. He continues; there was a recent, another article in the News Press, in the Mail Bag, from a person, Jean Metcalf, who I don't know, said (he reads content of the article), flat tax not fair, the voters in the Bayshore Fire district overwhelmingly rejected the quote Fair Flat Tax Assessment; Chief Nisbet doesn't seem to understand how totally unfair this was, according to him the District decided how much it would cost to respond to a fire while homeowners would pay a flat fee per structure on their property without regard to the valuation of the property, if we use that reasoning with regard to the school taxes, I guess the homeowner who had two children would pay double, because it costs more to educate two. We tried to explain this to Chief Nisbet, but he was having none of it. Why should someone living on a property with a low evaluation pay more than what he or she is currently paying? We Bayshore residents want very much to support our fire department, but when many of us would wind up subsidizing more expensive properties, why would we support that? Mr. Brodtkin begins his own statements again, "It just seems like as far as bringing that back, that methodology, I know the Board had said they felt the methodology was fair, when you voted for it, and yet when the tax roll came in showing what people would be paying, you looked at what the non-profits would pay, and the churches would pay; we even looked over there at what was it, Pioneer Village, would go from paying something like \$33,000 to \$77,000 or something around there; I think a lot of people started wondering whether it was fair, and whether things should be adjusted. So it almost seemed like the Board after seeing the roll wondered, at least from my observation is, to how fair it was. So, just to me, if you're going to bring this back, I would recommend not bringing it back, based on what happened, but if you're going to bring it back, I would think you would try something... Commissioner Hansen asks Mr. Brodtkin if he brought another recommendation. Commissioner Cook asks, yeah, do we have any input? He continues, there is only one way to do it. We had a company look at it, and that's the way it has to be done, or it can't be done at all. Commissioner Hansen states that's the way it has been done everywhere else. That methodology; that passes the courts; we didn't come up with the methodology. Mr. Brodtkin continues, well the problem you're running into, I know, and I understand... Commissioner Hansen states we understand the problem of the people in a

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

trailer over here paying the same as the people with a big house, but that's what makes it fair; whether they're in a trailer or a big house, the same units are rolling to that fire. The same men are going to respond to try and save lives. Mr. Brodtkin states there are a lot of people that don't feel that methodology is fair, so it's just a disagreement. Commissioner Cook states "exactly, but we can't change the methodology, just because people disagree with it. I disagree with it because mine was going up so much, but, that's the only fair way to do it. And in two or three years, everyone's going to be at that rate anyway, so...sit back." Mr. Brodtkin says something about Lehigh talking about two hundred and some per house, I understand there's a different population and tax base there, he says. Commissioner Hansen states, different population, more homes, more... Mr. Brodtkin continues, but I think that's what you're running into, there's a couple of things that you're running in to, one is you're collecting from taxes now and some other sources, a little under 1.1M and you're trying to go to 1.8M to maintain your level of service that you have now, but from the tax payer's point of view, that's a huge jump in one year. You're talking like 65% or something like that in one year, not 5% or 10%. And the other thing you run in to of course, as I talk to people and I think it's a shame, but we get some people who say "taxes, oh no, we pay enough taxes", they don't even look at it, I'm disappointed in that because I think people ought to look at what the proposal is before they make a decision. But there's a certain segment of the population that...that's one of the things that we are all facing. Commissioner Hansen states he read their flyer. He continues, according to your flyer, everyone was going to pay \$586 more." Mr. Brodtkin denies that being their flyer. Commissioner Hansen states that Mr. Brodtkin may not know what their people are putting out, but that is what some of his people were putting out on mail boxes of people like the people who brought it to him. He offers to meet with Mr. Brodtkin and he will show him what he was given. Mr. Brodtkin argues it does not say they will pay both, only that the Fire Board has the authority to charge millage, which you do, even though you've said that you won't. This point remains unsettled. Commissioner Hansen states the whole process we were involved in was to try to educate people...Mr. Brodtkin argues that the Fire Board did nothing to try to educate people. Commissioner Hansen states we went door to door...Mr. Brodtkin states we did not, the Union did that. Commissioner Hansen states that it was our guys that work here that went door to door. Mr. Brodtkin states that no one put out any information that he saw regarding what the rates would be, or what the ballot language was. They were the only ones that put that information out. Commissioner Hansen reminds Mr. Brodtkin of the meeting we had here and that Mr. Brodtkin was here. Mr. Brodtkin states that we had a meeting here that we advertised as a town hall meeting not as a meeting to assess taxes or a methodology for taxes. He continues "we put up additional signs around the community in order to inform people that there was a meeting because you had one sign down here on Bayshore Rd. and half the people in Bayshore don't pass that sign depending upon where they live. If they go 31 or up Slater Rd. they'd never even see it. And I had people call me and say Town Hall Meeting, they didn't think it had anything to do with a fire tax assessment. Commissioner Hansen states the sign said "Fire Town Hall Meeting" what did they think it had to do with? Mr. Brodtkin states there's all kinds of things that wouldn't necessarily have to do with taxes or fees. Commissioner Cook says maybe next time we should do it different. Commissioner Hansen offers again to bring their flyer and we can sit down and talk about it. Mr. Brodtkin states he will be glad to do that. Commissioner Hansen states because there was a lot of misrepresentation coming around. Mr. Brodtkin states that's what they felt they got from the Fire Board, or at

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

least from Chief Nisbet. First he tells us, he continues, your rates are going to go up from \$2,500 to \$3,500 on your homeowners, the next time it was \$1,500 to \$2,500 on your homeowners, the numbers kept changing; and then we asked him, he came to our last meeting, we had a frank discussion, which was good, we kind of aired a number of things, we said "well how come you guys didn't inform us about the meeting for Pritchett Parkway?" and "Oh, we just found out about it the day before, we didn't know about it"... that's what you told me. Commissioner Hansen states that on that meeting, they called me on a Monday and asked if they could use the building on Tuesday. Mr. Brodtkin gets louder and asks why is it on the November 12<sup>th</sup> minutes you're talking about the meeting on December 2<sup>nd</sup> three weeks ahead? Commissioner Hansen states we weren't talking about that meeting. Mr. Brodtkin states you were talking about the meeting in your minutes, it's in your minutes for November 12<sup>th</sup>, the discussion about the meeting at the church for the Pritchett Project, that's three weeks ahead of the meeting. They are right in the minutes, and I've got the minutes here, Chief states that might be a different meeting, he doesn't know, Mr. Brodtkin states, the Pritchett Parkway Project. Chief Nisbet states it might have been with somebody else, it might have been something with County Code, remember I had said they had to do some changes with the cul-de-sacs, all that was going on at about that time. Twice Commissioner Cook asks what it matters. Another member of the public (later to identify herself at her turn in Public Comment as Holly Marth) asks who Mr. Brodtkin is. She graciously asks, as she is new to the meetings, if he would introduce himself and the group he represents, as he keeps saying we, and us... Mr. Brodtkin states there is a group, but he was here mostly representing his own personal views tonight, but there's a group he identifies as The Concerned Citizens of Bayshore Community that meets monthly, and when we heard about this, he continues, after all the decisions were already made in January, we put out some flyers trying to inform people about it. Ms. Marth asks... where did the flyers go? I live right down the road, and I don't know you and I would just like to be more informed. Mr. Brodtkin states we put some up on Lawhon's store, we put some in some stores and we distributed some to homes, and maybe we missed you or maybe you didn't see our flyer. But we distributed some in little plastic bags with little stones, we left them by people's mail boxes, so most people got them, and some people didn't get them. Ms. Marth says ok, I must be the some who didn't, but she continues, I just would like to be educated when I'm hearing someone talk so passionately, I don't know who you are. Mr. Brodtkin states and I can talk to you later so we don't take up all their time... She states, she just didn't know who he/they were, and didn't know if anyone else didn't either, but apparently they do. Mr. Brodtkin continues, and we want to support our Fire Board, we really do; we've had some differences, but the Fire Department is very important to the Bayshore Community. There's been some differences, we're discussing and trying to iron out, but we don't want to be against our fire department, we need our fire department. Ms. Marth states it just feels kind of hostile. Mr. Brodtkin states there has been some differences. Ms. Marth corrects herself to say "passionate", it just seems over passionate to her. She just wants to get the cast of characters right. Mr. Brodtkin states I can only discuss from my point of view, I feel like I'm getting misinformation sometimes. That's from my point of view. They may tell you something different. Ms. Marth states, I think the rate that they are recommending is high too, and my husband and I are going to get hit horribly, we have three buildings on our property and we are going to get our butts kicked on this, but if we drink Starbucks, we just won't drink as much. I mean, I've used the fire department when I shouldn't have. Commissioner Cook states the thing that

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

frustrates me about it a little bit, is we know what it costs to run a fire department, to maintain what we have this minute, exactly what we have right now, and it's that number that we gave, and I understand that the \$589 is too much for some people, or more than they thought it was going to be; same here. I thought if we did a fair tax, it might cost me \$400 a year, I thought that would be about what it would cost. I didn't know it was going to be \$589, it completely freaked me out, but that is a real number, we didn't make up a number and say we want to get this much money every year now. That's to maintain what we have. We could have made up a number that everybody likes, but we wouldn't have had enough to keep everybody. Commissioner Hansen states we looked at a number we could live on for three to five years. It wasn't like we said ok, we can do \$400 and then next year raise it \$100. Commissioner Cook adds, or set it at \$400 and lay two people off. That doesn't maintain our fire department. Mr. Brodtkin adds, of course the other thing that happened, I had Clyde Boles calling me, and I don't know Clyde Boles, I know the name from the past, and he was all hollerin', you know, about the budget, maybe you've all heard from him, or seen what's been written, about what he feels the size of the department should be for a rural community. So that's another thing to look at. Commissioner Hansen states Clyde says that, but he sat on the same Board and help build it. Ms. Marth adds, but it's a growing community. Commissioner Cook states that there are standards that we have to meet. National standards. Commissioner Griffin agrees, and adds that the problem with Bayshore... Mr. Brodtkin interrupts and says the State has done us a disservice, all of us, by creating a system that's not that workable. Because there should be more options, we just don't have the options. Commissioner Griffin continues, that the problem out here is there are some people that have been out here for many, many years, and their taxes are low and they don't value much. Mr. Brodtkin states it depends what you mean by low, because we pay more than other fire districts. Commissioner Griffin agrees, as far as the millage rate, you're right. But that has to be because there's no commercial here, there's no money here, compared to the other departments. The other departments get their money from the commercial places, the tax money from that. Here there is none, we've tried to keep it down. The problem is here there is none, there's no money, there's bigger homes going in, higher dollar and that, but we are as high as we can go; we can't get any more. We've been maxed out. Commissioner Cook states we even lowered it when values were up a few years back, we lowered the millage. We didn't keep it at 3.5. We've adjusted it to what we needed to run it. Commissioner Griffin states that's the reason we did the survey, if you didn't know, this isn't something that just happened in January, this has been going on since 2009, 2008-2009. Commissioner Cook adds that our Chief has made sure we got the grants, he wrote the grants and got us money to prolong this; we could have done this layoff five years ago. Five years ago we could have done this, and we'd be sitting here with I guess 6 guys. Mr. Brodtkin states that one question some people ask is how does Alva manage? Commissioner Cook states they don't manage that great; what do they run; maybe 300 calls a year. Chief Nisbet adds that their ISO rating is either a 9 or a 10 depending on where you are. Commissioner Griffin adds that they have way less, their department is way less, and we have a lot more here and there's beginning to be more here than Alva even has to think about. Mr. Brodtkin adds that we also have a lot of Bayshore that is within 5 miles of the North Fort Myers fire departments. Commissioner Griffin adds that North Fort Myers is fixing to be in the same shape, they're included in the 105 fire fighters getting laid off, which they are working on doing the same thing which we were trying to accomplish here. It's not just us, we can't depend on other places to come to

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

here. When we lose these six guys, that's what Chief Nisbet was just talking about, we are not going to be able to send people. Commissioner Cook states North Fort Myers is doing the same thing, their vote is in November and if they don't get it, then we don't get any mutual aid from them. How we going to get it from Alva? We talk about mutual aid, but there's not going to be as many guys to send. The work force is going down. Mr. Brodtkin states, that may be the reality of it. Commissioner Cook states there is no maybe, that is going to be the reality. It is the reality. Commissioner Hansen says "things are gonna' burn. Commissioner Cook says it's not even about the fires, as he was telling his neighbors when he walks around the circle; half them are going up, and half are staying the same, maybe a few are going down; but I'm walking around, and they come out and ask me questions, and I say, in five years that's what you're going to be paying anyway, we're just trying to not lay off the six guys and in the next five or six years have to hire six guys again to meet the growth of the area. We're trying to make it fair for everybody. It's not even just about fires, he asked how many we go to a year, Chief responds roughly 25, Commissioner Cook continues, it's about the guy who's out there and has a heart attack pushing a mower; who's going to come? EMS isn't going to come; they're already taking someone to the hospital, most of the time they aren't even here. You call 911; the Fire Department is the first to show up. That's who shows up to heart attacks; that's who shows up when somebody slips and falls in the shower and busts their head open, that's who shows up. You call 911; the Fire Department is who shows up. EMS is the second ones there. He asks Chief how many of those they run. Chief Nisbet responds, oh, a lot...just to give you some kind of idea, North Fort Myers was just working a cardiac arrest, I believe around in station three area, and the ambulance that showed up was the Iona McGregor ambulance, Medic 15. Commissioner Cook states everybody knows that in heart attacks minutes make a big difference; between death, or brain damage, anything. Commissioner Griffin adds that sort of thing happens all the time; his neighbor fell off his horse, he's the one who had a ruptured spleen, and the ambulance he got was from Sanibel. The fire department was there. Commissioner Cook guesses that about 95% of our calls are medical calls. Chief responds it's more like 60/40 split. Captain Brunson remarks if Lehigh gives up their ALS, you can kiss Medic 19 good-bye; you'll never see them here. Commissioner Cook states that's the reality of it; we've basically done this for years; I take it kind of personal when people come in here and question the way we did it; we weren't sneaking around, we have open meetings once a month and nobody shows up. It would be nice if people cared enough to help. Mr. Brodtkin states they didn't know... Commissioner Cook says we hold them the second Tuesday of every month, it never changes. Mr. Brodtkin complains but no one let them know this was being discussed until they were called in January. Commissioner Cook responds we can't send a letter to everybody about what we're going to discuss. Commissioner Hansen adds but if you had an interest, you'd be here. He said it in the big meeting; if you had an interest you'd be here; not just when it's something...Commissioner Cook finishes...that affects your house, or you. Commissioner Hansen continues...You supposedly represent the community to the County; you should be here every meeting, finding out what's going on. Mr. Brodtkin states they are volunteers who are working 60 hours a week, and have a lot of work to do... Commissioners Cook and Hansen both state they do also. Mr. Brodtkin replies, so unless we hear there's something that needs attention...Commissioner Hansen responds, only if it's something you don't like, then you show up. Even if it's something you like, you don't show up, but if it's something you don't like, then you show up. Commissioner Cook states

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

truly everything we do needs attention. That's why we have public meetings. Why do you think we have public meetings? A woman's interjection is heard (she is later introduced as Karen Kamener) stating I think we should have had three public meetings for the last year to discuss this before it even went out there. Commissioner Cook states we had 12 meetings last year discussing this. Commissioner Hansen states every month we meet and we discuss this stuff, and if you're interested, you'd know. The sign is out, the things are up, it's in the newspaper. Mr. Brodtkin replies, we know there's a monthly meeting, we don't know that there's... Commissioner Cook states that's your fault. Commissioner Griffin adds we advertise the meeting, we can't advertise the whole agenda. Commissioner Hansen states if you're the head person of the Concerned Citizens of Bayshore committee, it should be your job to make sure that someone on your committee is here. They can report back to you, hey, this is what they talked about this month. Commissioner Cook adds, or hey we don't like this... Commissioner Hansen points out that normally everything goes another month or two before we vote on it. Commissioner Cook states we didn't just talk about this in one meeting and decide in the meeting and vote on it. No, we talked about this for months... Commissioner Hansen adds, the firm came in and spoke to us and explained stuff, and... Commissioner Cook states, we talked about it two years ago, because we might not get a grant, we didn't know if we were going to get a grant or not. Chief Nisbet adds, addressing Steve, if you recall when we had our first meeting, and I invited you and North Olga, and North Fort Myers Civic Association, they had not finalized the approval on that, but that was me reaching out to you to make sure that your group did know. Mr. Brodtkin says, right, and that was the beginning of January. Chief Nisbet says that was a week and a half after we had just gotten the study back. Commissioner Hansen says, in all fairness, that meeting over at the church, not his responsibility, not my responsibility; you're the liaison from the community to the County, why didn't the County tell you they were having a meeting? Mr. Brodtkin replies, and I complained to them. Commissioner Hansen points out, you have complained to us ever since that meeting, it's done and over, but yet you keep bringing that up to us. Commissioner Cook states, but why do we have to notify you of meetings? Commissioner Hansen states, that is not our responsibility. That is a County group using a church, for a meeting. They called me as a Minister... Mr. Brodtkin interrupts, I feel that there's an issue, when I'm lied to, and I'm being told nobody knew about the meeting the day before, and you have minutes three weeks ahead of that when everybody was discussing the meeting. Commissioner Hansen says, we'll have to look at the minutes, Chief says yeah, I'll have to double check that, but he doesn't recall it to be the same meeting. Commissioner Griffin states, I don't think I've missed a meeting, but I don't have a clue what you're talking about. Commissioner Cook states, it may have come up, but he doesn't know what the point is. Commissioner Hansen states, that's the just of what I am saying, it's not our responsibility to inform you. A concerned citizen would be informed, by being here. Sixty hours or not; I'm a Minister at a church full-time, I'm an alligator catcher full time, I'm a commissioner here, I make sure I make my meetings. I put in 15-16 hour days sometimes, Steve, I'm still here. I make time for it because it's important to me. Commissioner Cook states it has been more than three minutes. Mr. Brodtkin states, we spend a lot of time at the meetings with the County, about County issues. Commissioner Hansen says, but what I'm saying is you're not here, and then you come here and belly ache because you didn't know. The meetings are open, come and find out. I would bet, if you called the office tomorrow, they would tell you what the meeting was about. They'd give you a copy of the minutes. There's no secrets here;

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

we're not hiding and meeting outside the Sunshine. Commissioner Griffin asks what meeting they are talking about. Commissioner Hansen responds, the County had some kind of meeting that they didn't get invited to, or they didn't know about... Ms. Kamener responds, it wasn't the County, it was Stoneybrook, or what do they refer it to now? Commissioner Hansen replies Northbrook... Ms. Kamener states, the Developer that Bayshore fought... Commissioner Griffin responds it really doesn't matter; it had nothing to do with us, it doesn't have anything to do with us. Commissioner Cook states, not until it's built or being built.... Commissioner Hansen states, Chief wasn't at the meeting... Mr. Brodtkin states, but he discussed the meeting three weeks ahead, and when we talked to him at the church about it, he said he didn't know anything about it until the day before. That's all I'm saying. Commissioner Hansen states Chief did not know about the meeting because they called me to use the building, the day before. Ms. Kamner asks Mr. Brodtkin if he has a copy of the minutes. Commissioner Cook asks what it matters, three minutes are up. Vice-Chairman Griffin taps the gavel to conclude the rhetoric. He states he will review the minutes, as he would like to know himself, but we will move on to the next person. Commissioner Cook would just like to move on. Someone else states it was Northbrook's responsibility to notice their meeting. Commissioner Hansen states his point is it's a dead horse. That was seven months ago. Ms. Kamener states, I spent I don't know how many days reading four years worth of minutes because you guys called us crazy, and I'm just like...what? I had no idea the Board and the Chief felt that way. Vice Chairman Griffin calls for order, and Ms. Marth defers to allow Ms. Kamener speak first. Ms. Kamener reads the segment of the minutes of November 2013 to which they refer with regard to the meeting we did not inform them of. Commissioner Hansen says he doesn't get it. When Chief was over there at their meeting, it was six months later. Commissioner Cook states again, what's the point, what are you accusing someone of? What if Chief did state a mistruth; what if he forgot? He notes you guys are supposedly very busy people, but you've got a lot of time to look through a lot of stuff over nothing, it's kind of small; really very small. It was not our meeting; we didn't put on a meeting and not tell you about it. Mr. Bodkin states we had some complaints about our group, we had some airing at our meeting, which was good, but then when I find out later that some of the things he told me at the meeting weren't true...Commissioner Cook says only that, that's the part that bugged you? Mr. Brodtkin states, well let me ask, how much does a starting firefighter make? Chief Nisbet states \$40,000. Mr. Brodtkin states in the News Press in their editorial, the information they got from you, the average firefighter makes \$41,000. Commissioner Griffin states the average was probably county wide. Mr. Brodtkin corrects it was talking about Bayshore, and that Bayshore was lower than most. There are comments from both sides as to the value of an editorial and feelings about accuracy in newspapers. Ms. Marth asks where this is going, she is very confused as to the point. Vice-Chairman Griffin asks Ms. Kamener if she is finished? She says she is not, but if he would like her to go last, she has several points. Ms. Marth asks her to proceed. Vice Chairman Griffin says he is resetting the time allotted as she didn't get to speak. She introduces herself and states she has lived in the Bayshore Community for 30 years, she lives 660' from the county line, between 31 and 75; she states she has read our minutes from Jan. 8, 2013 and the reason I am bringing this up, I knew we had the issue over North River Village, when the Chief went down and said the Fire Department supported it, but I never knew that you guys felt the way that you did. Tracy has never let on, and I've had many conversations with Tracy. She reads from the minutes where the opinion is stated that their group is a joke. In

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

summary, the minutes outline the opinion that their group is against any growth and does not fairly represent the Bayshore Community in that it actively works with the County against development, meets out of Sunshine, and is founded on petitions that were signed many years ago to stop the mine. She continues, Stoneybrook... and is going to read something Sharon Estinoz who is on the Governing Board said about Stoneybrook North. She continues this is about the flooding out here. You want the development to come in for your tax base; well, until you build a ten-mile canal for North Fort Myers, like they have down in South Fort Myers so they could do all that development...we are considered the northern everglades, and until you build a canal and say to heck with all the environmental stuff, and storing water out here for the wells and the aquifers... I don't come to these meetings out here because I meet with DOT and Water Management, and Division of Natural Resources, and I could go on and on...Commissioner Cook states, before you do, you're at 5½ minutes, where's this going? Because we're trying to run a Fire Department here. I don't understand what this has to do with us. Ms. Kamener states, you're also fighting with the citizens because you want to increase the tax base by more development. Commissioner Cook states that's his opinion. Is he not allowed to have an opinion? Ms. Kamener states well if you want more growth, put in a canal. Commissioner Cook states we can't put in a canal, we're a fire board, we fight fires. Ms. Kamener states I don't see you at any of the meetings, you weren't at the Stoneybrook meetings fighting to get them to put in a 40' wide ditch. Ms. Marth asks if that is Commissioner Cook's opinion as a Commissioner or an individual. He replies as an individual. She asks then why it even matters; in her opinion, personally, she states, you're charging too much, but me as a human, if I fall off my roof, I want to know that one of these guys is going to show up. Ms. Kamener insists on reading what Sharon Estinoz stated about the comp plan. Commissioner Cook asks what this has to do with us. Ms. Kamener brings up again how we called them crazy, because they are against development. Ms. Marth asks Chief Nisbet to apologize to them for calling them crazy. Chief Nisbet states he already has. Commissioner Hansen points out it was Commissioner Ducrou who called them crazy, it wasn't Chief. Ms. Kamener states, look you want the development, you can't have the development until you do something about the flooding. Commissioner Cook states again, we have no control over any of it. Ms. Kamener states, well then don't call us crazy because we're trying to do something. Commissioner Hansen states, we are simply stating that as a fire department, in order to be financially stable, we need some growth. We can't get it out of the residents that are already here, so we've got to look for growth; it's one of the two. Chief Nisbet states that meeting to which Karen refers is when we had a very passionate discussion where I disagreed with some of the board when we were talking about the suspension of impact fees, where the Fire Chiefs were addressing that and how the capital improvement was; the discussion came up, and yeah, some inappropriate comments were made, I went to the Bayshore Citizens meeting last month and apologized for those inappropriate comments, also advised that our meetings are very transparent because it was in the minutes. But, it was an inappropriate comment and I did apologize on behalf of the District, that it took place. Commissioner Cook states, I apologize as a Board. Ms. Kamener brings up again how we do not go to these meetings about these large developments. She states she has a letter from Gerald Campbell from Emergency Management where they did not support North River Village. They were fundamentally against it because...Commissioner Cook asks again what that has to do with us. Ms. Kamener states, because your Chief went before the LPA and supported North River

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

Village. Chief Nisbet states, Right, I supported North River Village because...Ms. Kamener states because you wanted the taxes...Commissioner Cook states, and they were going to build us a fire station...Chief continues, and I am required to give an opinion on any project that is built here on the serviceability aspect of it. Ms. Kamener states, I don't understand why you would support a project that Emergency Management is against. Chief states it is a different division. Commissioner Cook argues why can't they have opinions and feelings, they can (referring to the Concerned Citizens of Bayshore)...Ms. Kamener states her feelings are based on state law, federal law and Lee County Law. Commissioner Cook asks what law; we can't have a fire board and grow? Ms. Kamener says, No. The growth needs to be in an appropriate place. Commissioner Cook responds this is totally inappropriate, I don't understand what this has to do with this Board Meeting. Ms. Kamener states, if you're not going to talk about it in here, then don't judge our group and what we do. Commissioner Cook states, we apologized for anything that you took...Well still, Ms. Kamener continues, I don't believe that's going to stop here. Steve said at one of our meetings... who is Mr. Ducrou? Multiple advised he is our Chairman who is not here tonight. Ms. Kamener continues, well he showed up to one of our meetings and said the reason Hunters Glen is a problem is because they didn't fill their yards enough. Commissioner Cook and Vice Chairman Griffin both state this has gone 10 minutes and isn't helping one bit. Commissioner Klos states we are trying to run a business here, us five, when we are here, are trying to run a business. Commissioner Cook states we are trying to make this place survive. Commissioner Klos, we like growth, yes; you ask Lawhon's, you ask Horsin' around Deli, and Hogbody's, would they like growth, absolutely; because that's going to bring revenue and money into their business. That's why we want it, to bring money into our department. We need to build another fire station. We need business, that's what makes our business grow. Commissioner Cook states we need to build a tax base. Ms. Kamener states, well, I don't want to hold any more water. I've lowered a yacht, and Pritchett put up that berm...Commissioners Cook and Klos both state she is complaining in the wrong place, she needs to go to the County and complain. That has nothing to do with us. Ms. Kamener continues, if you're going to be supporting these developments that are going to make our flooding worse...Commissioner Cook asks, what do you think we are as a support? We say, hey we support that, but we don't give them anything, we don't make the decision; they don't care what we think. If we support it, they really don't care what we think. They care more about what you think. Commissioner Hansen states, the decision is made by all those people you're looking at there (presumably referring to the County and Water Management). Commissioner Griffin states, yes, we want the money, so that we can keep these guys in their job to protect your life, our lives, and our families' lives. Mr. Brodtkin states, everybody comes to us and they say we came out here to be in a rural place; Commissioner Cook states, not everybody, because he didn't. Mr. Brodtkin states, well the bulk of...Ms. Marth states, well, life changes. Commissioner Griffin states, I'd like to say something, about meetings, as far as your meetings, I found out about your meetings about six months ago. I don't know what day they are on, but... Someone remarks, they're in the paper. She responds the North Fort Myers Neighbor. Ms. Kamener responds Tracy has been opening the church for us since 2007, when I started with this, and before. Commissioner Griffin states, Tracy doesn't come here and talk about meetings...Ms. Kamener states, I asked Theresa for your e-mail list so that I could start communicating...Commissioner Cook states, I'll give you mine right now...Ms. Kamener states, and she said some of you don't look at it, and

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

one of you doesn't even have an e-mail, so I never got the list. Commissioner Cook states what would it matter, all this stuff is silly...Ms. Kamener states, I can't believe the level of ignorance I'm seeing here tonight. Vice Chairman Griffin calls for the next speaker. Commissioner Cook states, me either. Ms. Marth states to Ms. Kamener, but wait, are you calling someone ignorant? Ms. Kamener states we don't have a major fire issue out here, we have a water problem out here. Ms. Marth states, but this isn't the water department. Mr. Lemieux tries to speak but is unable. My neighbor died, Ms. Kamener continues, and the reason he died was because you couldn't get down the road in time because we were so flooded. Vice Chairman Griffin calls for order. Ms. Kamener insists on continuing, but I think the fire department should be educated about the water issues out here. Mr. Lemieux speaks, when you have a concern over water, and you have an issue with flooding on your streets, does water management handle that? Ms. Kamener states, no, water management keeps permitting more and more stuff. Mr. Lemieux continues, so do they come out and put rock on your road, do they call and make sure that someone comes out and puts rock on all these roads? Commissioner Cook and Mr. Lemieux both respond that Chief Nisbet does. Mr. Lemieux continues, that's not his job. Ms. Kamener states, I thanked him before. Commissioner Cook states, I'd like to hear you thank him tonight. Ms. Kamener states, thank you very much for getting the rock put on the road, I appreciate it. Vice Chairman Griffin calls Ms. Holly Marth. Ms. Marth begins, I want to first say thank you Steve, and Karen; I think your passion for what you believe in is phenomenal, honestly, I truly, truly do, and when you walked in that Town Hall Fire Meeting with that huge..., I was like, wow, this lady knows her stuff. I think it's phenomenal that you research and do everything that you are doing. I think it's awesome. I don't have a problem at all with what both of you are doing for your group, by no means, but I'm here at a fire meeting, and I don't understand why we're talking about development and water issues. I know we flood back there, and I know, God forbid, if Henderson Grade is flooded, no one's going to be able to get back into my home and save me if I'm hurt. I get that. . I totally do, but I knew what that road was like when I moved there, or ten years later when it started getting worse. No one's keeping me at my property except my husband and me, we're why we are there, and it is what it is, if we don't like it, we can leave. Ms. Kamener states, well that's the thing, why should I be displaced, because the local government is allowing the development. Ms. Marth asks, because the fire department is not working on your issue? Mr. Brodtkin offers to explain it to her later, she declines, stating, I don't need it explained to me. If the problem is the water, she states, then I go to the water, then I go to all the different agencies... Ms. Kamener states that what she does. Ms. Marth states, and I think that's wonderful, keep going there, but these guys are dealing with fire, and oxygen needs, and lives...Ms. Kamener says, no, they sit at their meetings and they criticize us; they have no clue what we're working on, they don't come to the water management stuff... Ms. Marth states, and I agree, it's wrong, but as a Christian, he apologized, others apologized, move forward; if we have so much baggage in our lives that we can't just let it go and move forward, we're never going to get anywhere. Start right now with what the problem is, if it's water, go talk to someone who deals with water. If it's fire and saving lives, we talk to these folks. And I wanted to be home by 8:00 and I'm not going to be now, and I'm not saying this is only worth an hour of my time, but it's gone off track so much. I'm a director for our local Board of Realtors, and we've had five hour board meetings, but it wasn't going around and around and around, we had meat that we were discussing. So I would like to get to the meat of my questions if I may. Vice Chairman Griffin bids her to do so. She

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

continues, I have a probably ignorant question for a lot of you folks who wear the shirts and the hats, and I apologize, why if we have a possible lay-off coming up, I don't understand why the fire academy would be training more fire people to fill positions that are being deleted from people who are already experienced, and do the local fire stations have any say in that? Commissioner Klos explains that they could go to the other coast and get hired. Ms. Marth says they could go to another area and get certification and then come and apply here and get jobs. Commissioner Griffin explains the fire academy is run by Lee Vo-Tech and you have to pay to go there, and it is a business. Just like any college. Ms. Marth now gets it. Just like this is, she says. I didn't know if any part of it was a part of the local fire stations. The other question I have, I don't remember which one of you three said it, but it is the only choice we have, and it is the only one that has gone through all of the protocol (referring to the assessment methodology) is the one that was presented. I think that the question mark at the end of the sentence on the ballot was a huge mistake, be it clerical or not, and an unknowledgeable, uninformed, unknowing person would have seen that question mark, because it said something about this was the amount that it was going to be raised question mark. Chief agrees and states that was because that was the end of the ballot question, and we tried to address that. Ms. Marth continues, she suggests that be changed next time. She asks if we don't have time between now and November to come up with anything at all that could be different, that would keep us from having to pay what we're going to be paying, if this passes. Commissioner Cook states, the only way would be to lower the actual dollar amount. But that's not going to get us what we need. Chief Nisbet states that we can actually do that if it passed; the Board has the ability to address those rates in the management resolution, very similar to what we talked about in the last meeting about the non-profits and the institutionals, which we were going to look at them to be the same as the commercial rate. Based upon the quantitative data that was done in the study, and those rates that were in, just like when you approve a millage rate, you approve a maximum millage rate; we can always set a lower millage rate if we have excess funds, and we've done that before. Commissioner Cook states that however doesn't help us on our ballots. Chief continues, that's the maximum rate that we would be looking at, based upon the study that was completed. Ms. Marth states that is my concern right now, I don't know if any of these folks are ones who may be laid off, (one of the staff raises his hand, and Ms. Marth states put your hand down, you're my oxygen guy!) I don't want to see anyone laid off, but at the same time, my rates going to go up, I can't do that, I don't drink coffee, I can't not do the Starbucks every day. Isn't there anything we can do as a group, get a group of knowledgeable, intelligent people together to see if there isn't something between now and November that we can tweak, because I think even if the citizens can see that you're at least trying, that we are at least trying to come up with something different, trying being the key word, maybe we won't feel as stifled, well this is the one option they gave us and it's either yes or no. Chief Nisbet offer to jump in real quick to give her some kind of idea. Chair gives permission. Chief continues; Theresa and I are starting to work on the budget information and looking at stuff like that. The SAFER grant was sustaining us so well, that without the SAFER funding and going down to the six positions I'm going to have about \$24,000 to maneuver around. Ms. Marth states, I don't mean cutting the budget, I mean changing what can be done with raising..., I mean I wouldn't mind paying half more, but not... Commissioner Cook states that does not sustain what we have... Commissioner Griffin states anything you lower, it doesn't...well, one of the problems, we looked at

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

keeping our millage rate and then add on to it; well if property taxes go...Commissioner Cook asks if she's seen how much her stuff went up already? Three years from now, most of us are going to be paying \$589. Ms. Marth asks, so there's absolutely, positively, in your educated from all of the data opinions, no other way to make the books balance? Commissioner Griffin states there's probably other ways, the problem is to get it voted in. Commissioner Cook states he doesn't know what that would be; we're trying to get to a fair assessment, not a tax. Commissioner Hansen states the wording is, we have to go by state statute, what the state will allow us to do, and they have only given us these avenues. Here's your avenue, so pick one. Chief Nisbet states we could have maintained the Ad-valorem and done a rate on top of it, which would have brought it down to about the \$88,000 mark on the assessed value, everyone at the \$88,000 mark or higher would have been paying what we originally proposed, or higher, and the other way about \$168,000 was the breakeven point the way we proposed it. Commissioner Cook notes the blended system failed down at Iona McGregor. Ms. Marth asks, even so, in y'all's educated opinion, we're going to be stuck with this number in 2, 3, 4 years from now anyway. Commissioner Cook feels it will be very soon because his jumped quite a bit. Chief Nisbet states it depends on the home. He states the older homes were the ones taking the hit because they had been held at 3% since they were built 20 or 30 years ago. The cap on the save our homes kept them at 3%, whereas those built right around 2001 and since carried higher assessed values. Commissioner Cook states he feels many people do not understand the way the millage works, He states, I can live in the exact same home as one of my neighbors and depending on when they bought their home, they could be paying double what I do in taxes; how is that fair? We both live on ¼ acre lots, have the exact same house, same square feet, same value; and they could be paying double. Commissioner Cook does not feel that's a fair way. He continues, so what you pay on your ad-valorem tax depends on when you bought your house. Commissioner Griffin states we felt if we added the assessment on top of the millage, we felt it might be construed as double taxation. With no more discussion from Ms. Marth Vice-Chairman Griffin calls Chad Jorgensen. Mr. Jorgensen introduces himself and states it pains me to see where we've gotten here; I'll be honest with you, on all sides of this. So I was involved with Bayshore a long time ago when they were looking to put a fill pit in and it was a bad deal and it was a dangerous deal; and we got together with the folks in our District and we rallied around it and we prevented it from happening, and I'm glad we did it. It was up Nalle Rd. to Nalle Grade, it was going to be a very dangerous kind of situation. I get that there's anger, I feel it. It's palpable. I mean just sitting here listening to you guys talk, it's visceral. You guys are upset, and probably for good reason in your mind. I do not doubt that. The problem is, and I think we're losing it; six people are going to be out of a job. Just think about that for a second. Now whether you agree, \$40,000, or \$41,000; I've got to say, that's an angry thought. It really... that doesn't matter...six people...I mean; it does matter to someone who wants to be kind of picky about it... Can we agree that there have probably been mistakes made on both sides; people got aggravated; we've got to move forward. This is a small place; we can't sit here and be at each other's throats; that's a bad... this is a bad deal. This is a bad deal; so... I don't have the answer for this other than to say, I'm able to put; because I am still tied to another Fire Department, and I'm tied to the Lee County C-Pat which is the cooperative hiring for Lee County; and whoever asked the question; you asked the question about the Fire Academy; I get it; it's a depressing thought when potentially 105 people are going to be out of a job; it's sobering to me. It sends chill and

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

people that have mortgages, and people that have kids, just for a second, people need to think about where would you be in your life if you no longer had a job tomorrow? I don't know; I would be in deep trouble in my world, that's all I can say. He continues, but I'm going to make sure that the six people that are listed to be without a job are listed on the C-Pat; it doesn't guarantee them a job, it just guarantees that...Ms. Marth asks what C-Pat is. Chief Nisbet explains briefly that it is the County-wide hiring list. Mr. Jorgensen states that he will put them on the list so that the Departments that are looking will see them, but the problem is, they won't have scores, but at least they'll know that these are the people who were laid off. Hopefully they'll look at that. Ms. Marth asks if Mr. Jorgensen is a firefighter. He replies, I am, I work at Iona. Ms. Marth asks if he is the one who lives right down the road. He replies that he is, and he's been here for more than 20 years. She responds "How Cool". He continues, I've been here, like many of you, long before Bayshore was what it is today...and the one thing that I find really troubling is that we're getting into the minutia, and I get why you guys don't want growth, I understand that, I do; this is a beautiful place; the only thing that I would ask you to do is, just for a little bit, look at their world; and they're looking at people who are no longer going to be employed. This is not a game; this is not a joke; people are losing their livelihood. That's a very bad thing. He continues; I'm not trying to speak down to you, you know this; you understand this. Ms. Kamener agrees, she does, and states; I don't wish for them to lose it; that's not my primary, I mean, I didn't come here to talk about the tax issue, I wish there was another, because I told the Chief, when I was talking to him when they got rock on the road last fall, and I told him, I would be willing to support an increase, but I had no idea what was going to be put on the table. Commission Cook agrees, neither did he. And, she continues, I did not say I supported it because you got us the rock. I said I supported it because it is the right thing to do. If our fire department is in trouble, then we need to support them. Mr. Jorgensen states he appreciates her saying that, and I get that you have your own concerns about growth...Ms. Kamener continues, well I just want us to be educated about the water issues and the problem, because you are the one who told me, I don't know if you remember, in this room, I don't know how many years ago it was, that Darrel Dushane died of a heart attack, and that they thought that they might have been able to save him if they could get down the road in time...well I stepped over that man's dead body to get his wife's phone and purse, ok? I couldn't even open the door all the way, and she stood out there in the parking lot crying hysterically, and what I did, I refinanced my tin can mobile home, because I'm just trailer trash according to everyone else, or the way this society reacts towards trailers, anyway, I refinanced my mobile home so I could pay off my charge cards, so I could rent a backhoe and put in 40 pieces of culvert on Bradley and Wellborn roads. And I got the contractors, they donated the culverts and they donated the backhoe for a months' time at a week's cost. And that's what I did for my immediate community, and that's why I don't like the development, is because they keep putting up more and more berms and nobody's doing anything about alleviating the drainage, they want to raise Rt. 31 6"...Commissioner Klos calls to Chad; she continues, there's so much you guys don't know...Commissioner Griffin tries to talk stating we all live out here, and we all deal with the flooding, just as well as you do; we understand that, we don't want it either, we're here to keep...Ms. Kamener states we're flooded for a long, long time, out there, like three and a half months out of the year...Mr. Jorgensen continues, in any case, I do think, for whatever it's going to take to mend this, this is not the way to have these discussions, I've got to tell you, what I'm saying is, I know this guy, (referring to Chief Nisbet), I've known

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

him a long time, and I've worked with him before, we're all people, I guarantee you; Steve, I know you...you're active in the community, you're not a bad guy, you're trying to make things happen, I get that, but, honestly, you know this is not the forum to do this. Come and see him, work things out, do it as a group, you want an advocate, you don't want to be at loggerheads. Bayshore Fire Department is not going to have a deciding factor in the development, they're not, they are a small cog in the wheel, that's the truth of the matter. I get why you want that support, because you don't want the development; on the other hand, all I'm asking you to do is just think for a second, when they lose six people, and the roads flood, and emergency management does not send any people out that they used to, they ask the Chief "would you go out and check" you pick a road, and he says, "you know, I'd like to but I can't, because I don't have the people to send out there", it's not going to help us, it's not going to help us get emergency rock, it's a bad thing. I've lived the life, I'm not telling you funk; I'm telling you the truth. I don't have an answer for the world that we're dealing with here, other than I am just ashamed that we're losing six people. And I feel really bad about that; and I would hope that you guys meet and deal with things; I've seen this before; we can deal with things better; honestly, and I appreciate that you did what you did; that says you put your heart with what you are saying. You're not just advocating something, you're doing it, but, think about it...come in here and blasting back and forth, all your doing is this (as he hammers his fists together). Commissioner Cook adds that he's sure that there's many people here that would have helped you do that. Many, many people; we have tractors, we have dump trucks, and people have dirt companies... Ms. Kamener states, I contacted Chief Campbell at the time and I asked him, all the contractor wanted from him, because the contractor offered to put culverts in free under Wellborn Road, and I asked Chief Campbell if all they would do is just, and they were talking about doing various places and Bayshore, and Chief Campbell said they did not want to get, all we asked Chief Campbell to do was to have someone from the fire department tell us where the main washouts were, that you guys were concerned about, that cause the most problems; and we were going to go around with the contractor and they were going to decide how much they were willing to do. And Chief Campbell said that he wasn't getting involved because it was too political. Commissioner Cook states, but as of now, I know that he (pointing to Chief Nisbet) does a lot... Commissioner Griffin states, that was in the past... Ms. Kamener states, but he just said that if we had just called, somebody would have helped, but I called, and the only help I asked for was to be shown the washouts... Commissioner Griffin states, I understand, but there's a lot of stuff in the past that we can't do anything about, some of us weren't even here then, some of us are here now because we didn't like the past... Ms. Kamener states this was 2007..., Commissioner Griffin states, there were things in the past that we wanted to change, and make this Department what it is today; and I think we did a pretty good job getting where we're at to protect you and to try to help in these situations... Commissioner Cook states, a real good job... this is embarrassing, this is embarrassing to us as a board, to lose six guys. Commissioner Griffin continues, we're not against you, but we feel that you are, that's how I personally feel. Commissioner Cook adds that's how he personally feels. Ms. Kamener states, I just don't want to be called crazy unless you know exactly what we've been working on and then can make a decent judgment about... Commissioner Griffin states, I didn't call you crazy. Ms. Kamener continues; all the meetings I've been to, all the people I've talked to... You didn't let me finish reading about Shannon Estinoz where she says it's the craziest thing she's ever seen... Commissioner Griffin states, well we have a three minute limit...

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

Commissioner Cook states, well we truly don't feel you understand what we're doing either. Ms. Kamener states, yeah I understand that you're having hard times and you're not able to keep your staff. Commissioner Griffin points out. "It's your staff". Commissioner Cook states that's correct and we didn't create... Ms. Kamener continues I wish that as a community with our combined intellect, we could figure out how to come up with that money other than bringing in new growth that may or may not pay for it all. Commissioner Cook states we just offered that. Commissioner Griffin states one way was to have the tax, the assessment was... Ms. Kamener states a lot of the people are upset because so many of the wealthy people are going to be getting a big break. Commissioner Cook states a lot of the people are upset because they didn't come and ask us questions, I've talked to some of the people that were going up quite a bit, and they finally said I understand, you know, I just gave them the facts. Yeah, it's going to cost them more. Commissioner Griffin states, well I just want to say too, that, I know my taxes are high, I know other people's taxes are way higher than mine, and they're not wealthy. It's just because of when, it's just because of what the tax roll has put their property at, what they paid for it at the time they bought it, time of year, whatever, depending on what year it was, so... It doesn't mean that people are wealthy... Commissioner Cook states, it has nothing to do with their wealth, it has to do with when they bought their house. Ms. Kamener states, let's say they have an \$800,000 home on the river, and they were paying \$3,000 in taxes... Commissioner Cook asks if that's fair. Ms. Kamener states it is if they have a mansion they want to save. Commissioner Cook states that we are sending the same people to whatever fire. You guys have to understand, this place costs the same right now as it does when everybody leaves and goes on a call. If they're watching TV it costs the same amount of money. It always costs the same. We're paying the guys by the hour to sit here for 24 hours. It doesn't cost us more to fight a fire at an 800,000 square foot home. We send the same amount of guys to everything; they send the same guys to your house. Ms. Kamener states, if this is a better process then why wasn't it the one that was historical? Why do they have taxes based on income? Commissioner Cook states, it is because of Ad Valorem is why we are talking about this right now. Because it exists. When everything was great, we were alright. He asks Chief how many guys we had when he started. Chief replies that staffing is at the same level as it was. He came right after they raised the millage to 3.5 mils to put four full-time on a day. Mr. Jorgensen confirms. Commissioner Cook asks how many we had when Mr. Jorgensen was Chief. He replies it was the same. Commissioner Cook asks, when I first got here as Commissioner. Chief Nisbet states that when he worked out here in 1989 as a firefighter, there were two full time firefighters, an office manager and a fire chief. Commissioner Cook states and now we got to where we have what I consider a real fire department to where we can get four guys to your fire; two in, two out; we can meet those standards, we thought we were doing the right thing and all of a sudden everyone's attacking us, the bottom falls out, taxes go away, everybody's value goes to nothing, foreclosures, short sales, everything else; now our budget is cut, what, in half? Chief responds 43.7% Commissioner Cook continues, 43%, now how do you do that when we run a budget that's 90% wages. Mr. Jorgensen adds that is typical. Commissioner Cook continues, that's typical in the county, the fire department is manpower, it's not fire trucks, it's manpower, so when you lose 40% and 90% is for personnel, something's got to happen, and that happened in... Chief says 2008. Commissioner Cook continues, that happened in 2008, and here we are six years later, and we've still got the same guys because of what we've done; these guys have taken

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

cuts in pay, given up education money, (Chief adds they don't get money in their vacation bank any more, they've given up pay for holidays); Commissioner Griffin states, they've given up a lot, and some of the stuff they had was to make it comparable to other similar departments in the area so that we could keep guys here... Commissioner Cook continues, there's all kinds of stuff that they've done, but we can't do it anymore, and it's not fair to make them take another cut because now you've got 12 guys that are below level; we have six guys that are getting laid off, but we have six guys that will still be able to feed their family and everything else; we're hoping it's a better way to do it. Chief Nisbet offers, Commissioner Cook, just to give you a hard, fast number, since 2008, we've lost \$2,033,518 or the equivalent of 1.35 budgets. Commissioner Cook continues, the numbers are just huge, and when we're asking for \$589 it truly isn't that much for what we're trying to do here. Commissioner Hansen states, and people said to me "tighten your belts"; I've lost money at home and had to tighten my belt, but not 43.7%. Commissioner Cook and Commissioner Hansen both point out that nobody's lost half their income. Commissioner Cook states if they have, 90% of their wages wasn't the; you know, it was their house payments and everything else. That's the problem we got there, and then what frustrates me too, people say, "well, these guys paying \$3,000 a year"; you act like somebody came to us and said we need to change this; we're not big government, nobody's in our pockets, nobody pays us to get what they want, we come in here and make \$100 a month to come in here and do this. So nobody's telling us "you guys need to cut my taxes"; nobody did that. We had to come in here and figure out how to run a department. They come and they give us this number, I've thought since I've been here there should be an assessment, didn't I Chad? Ever since day one, something like eleven years ago, I said there needs to be an assessment. Back then the assessment could have been probably \$400, but by now it probably would be \$589 because that is the number. We're not making numbers up. It's all open to you. We have packets in there that tell you exactly what the numbers are. That's the part that frustrates me. Vice Chairman Griffin calls Debbie Jackow. She begins by saying, I wasn't going to speak but I think I will. There was a way, that if we had this assessment, and let's say this passed, and you were still able to, at your own discretion, add into the millage, so that, in a way, that would still be like a dual tax, now is there a way to reverse this, to leave the 3.5 alone and to figure out a percentage, and it would probably have to be different for land than it would be for housing, because when you mention it the other way around, and you say ok let's say we add 20% of the value of each of these places, on to their bill, and then it gets into this whole "we don't want to double tax anybody" but at the same time, if you had this assessment and it went through, you could and probably would add back to the millage and it would still be a double tax. Commissioner Hansen asks why we would. She replies, because if you needed more money, you could, and it said that you probably would... Commissioner Cook states but that's not a fair way to do it, we didn't say that we would, we never said that. We, by law, have to have a millage. We wanted to make it where it didn't exist, but they wouldn't let us do it. Ms. Jackow continues, right, so say you took it to zero, and you got this money, but you have to understand too, when you got this money, you're really not going to get what that total was because of all the different people, because on this tax roll, not knowing what was on this tax roll, you can't charge on there, a lot of the properties that you were going to charge. You would have had to adjust them. Commissioner Cook states, no we wouldn't have to. Ms. Jackow argues, you would have had to adjust Upriver Campground probably \$100,000; Chief Nisbet agrees, she's actually

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

correct on some of her assumptions on that; that roll that I gave her was an uncertified roll, and remember that Upriver Campground was one of those areas we talked about because they went from like \$23,000 to \$177,000. It was ridiculous and I about freaked out looking at that too; and then what we found out was the way the Department of Revenue reported those as residential properties and the fact that even though they are fixed sites, they are registered vehicles because they have vehicle registration, it would have been at the 51¢ per square foot; but she is correct on some of that, and that was going to bring that number down; but it was still going to be, and that's why I told the Board, we were looking at about 3-5 years before that number might have to be adjusted based upon the median household income. So I did take some of that into consideration. He adds that we would only have assessed at 95% anyway because that's by state statute. Commissioner Cook agrees and adds, because some people don't pay. Commissioner Griffin states some people don't pay now. Commissioner Cook states so by raising it, we know they are still not going to pay. Commissioner Griffin points out that there are also properties that right now are not paying, but would be paying. Ms. Jackow states, I assume they are veterans, the ones that are paying nothing. Commissioner Cook states, no, we have some now that just don't pay their taxes. Ms. Jackow states, right, but then somebody comes in and pays them for them, and if they can't afford it, after so many years, they lose their dwelling. Commissioner Cook says, right, but we still have to figure 95% of what we think we're going to get for budget. Commissioner Hansen explains that our budget has to be built on 95% of what the tax man says. The taxman says we're bringing in this much; we have to go on 95% for our budget. Chief states and we usually collect a little bit better than 95%, and Debbie, you're right, we will eventually get those revenues sometime when somebody pays for a tax certificate or somebody doesn't pay their property taxes for a few years, but we'll see that 2 or 3 years, maybe even 4 or 5 years down the road from arrear taxes. Ms. Jackow continues, so basically, you can take this millage from 3.5 to zero, and this \$587.78 passed, and three years down the road, you still need more money, you still have the authority to take that zero millage and add, let's say a mil to it. Commissioner Cook agrees, he states, you could theoretically raise it to 3.5 mills. Ms. Jackow states, yes you could, and you would basically have a double tax. So can we reverse this, since you could do that, can we reverse this, leave this 3.5 and figure out a percentage that you could add on to everybody so that it would be fair and equitable? The Office Manager responds that a percentage is actually a millage; you cannot do a percentage since our millage is capped at 3.5. Commissioner Hansen restates it has to be a flat assessment to every household. Chief Nisbet explains that per state statute, the assessment has to be in the case of commercial or institutional by square footage, and residential it has to be the same rate across the board. Commissioner Hansen says that's the state statute he spoke of. Ms. Jackow asks if you could assess everyone say 20%. Commissioner Hansen further explains, they won't let you do 20% because everybody's property values are different. Commissioner Griffin says it has to be a dollar amount across the board. Commissioner Hansen states we can do \$100 per home across the board. We can't do a 20%. Ms. Marth states she'll take \$100 instead of \$1,600. Commissioner Cook states that you can work it any way you want, but it's still going to be \$587.78. Ms. Jackow explains, what I'm trying to point out, is that there's probably about ten different properties that you're going to be lowering a lot. I don't mean the residential places, I mean the non-profits, and the Pioneers, and Upriver and Echo, and the other one that was way up, so that what you were really aiming at in the first place, you're really not going to get. It's going to be cut

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

down, maybe to \$1.6M instead of 1.9; or 1.7M instead of 1.9M. The Board asks Chief what the number was we were looking for. Chief responds we were looking to bring in 1.8M and change. We were looking at, and you know with the adjustments we had under Upriver Campground that was going to be roughly a little over \$100,000... Commissioner Cook adds, how much with the churches, we were going to change that. Chief Nisbet continues, and bear in mind, there were items we had budgeted in there that we are not currently budgeting for right now; for example, station maintenance; air conditioner repairs, stuff like that, that we had put in a budgeted amount, that we could have adjusted those to take them out for a couple years or three years... Commissioner Cook states it was supposed to be a five-year plan; Chief Nisbet agrees, it was a five year plan and we could have made some adjustments in the capital item lines. The other part that we were also catching some issues that we were dealing with too; that the non-certified roll didn't show was the agricultural lands of the large agricultural land owners, you know they were looking at being assessed at 10 acres and they were looking at \$638 and when you look at what they said their assessed value was; you know some of these properties were like million dollar properties; but because they put cows on them, or put a cow or horse on it, they get the AG exemption and they get assessed at 1%. So they were looking at it; and some of these people had 40 plots, so they were looking at a huge impact; one person I can think of initially is Rick Pritchett. He was not exactly happy about it because of the amount of impact he was going to be looking at where he's paying high right now because of the AG exemption. Of course the other one was the Armeda family. You know they have a large portion of property. Large landowners, large landowners at first looked like they were going to get a big break, but they were actually going to take a pretty big hit. Ms. Jackow states that on the ballot it was not noted per parcel, it was just up to ten acres; and we've been around this a couple of times of what it said, and to me it's what did the ballot say; because that's the only thing you can vote on. And it's not on the ballot per parcel so you could have done the contiguous thing with those people; had them pay the one fee of \$639 and combined ten or twenty properties together... Chief Nisbet states and the Board could have done that, which would have been their decision. Commissioner Cook states see I thought that the way to do that, and I mentioned it to you, was to do it per acre. Period. I don't care if you have a hundred, a thousand, or five; per acre. That number would have been significantly lower, but we still had to get that same amount of money, I understand that, but... Chief Nisbet states the dollar amounts would have been the same from the acreage aspect. Commissioner Cook states that we'd have had to get our final dollar amount, but if you had ten acres it was considerably smaller than it was going to be with that number there. Ms. Marth states she likes that idea. Commissioner Cook continues, that made sense, but it still didn't change that \$587 number; that never changes, it can't change. Ms. Jackow states she's discussing them all. Commissioner Cook states it can make everybody feel better that the guys with the most property are paying more but it doesn't change what you're paying on your tax bill. Ms. Jackow states but on the ballot language, I'm trying to be specific, on the ballot language it was just a ten acre parcel period. It did not say "for every parcel that you have, per parcel, this is what you will pay" so that was like a gigantic loophole that people then would have also, because the Chief has discussed this; they want contiguous parcels. He's gone to the North Olga group and discussed it with them. Commissioner Cook yes, but like I say, if it's per acre we eliminate all that problem. Chief Nisbet states and that was just discussed as an option... Ms. Jackow states well that option they would like, and there's more money you would have

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

lost. So you really have to look at what that tax roll would have started at and then really do some deductions from there; and you would have had to adjust the churches, you would have had to adjust Pioneer, you would have had to adjust Echo, you would have had to adjust Upriver Campground, you were definitely going to get hit up by Northbrook Holdings, and Carter, and all these people that own numerous plots of land to come and pay one fee for all these things, that would then adjust your money down, so you really need... Commissioner Cook states but we would have had a base to work with. Ms. Jackow says right; but you don't know what your base would have been. Commissioner Cook states it would have been better than what we've got now. It would have been a plus over what we've got right now; it would have been an increase, and we could have worked all that out, and figured out what the numbers should be, how we're going to get to the numbers we need, because right now we have nothing. We have zero. Ms. Jackow states and all the industrial parcels would have gone down. I don't think they should go down... Commissioner Cook states we would have discussed that in meetings and we would have adjusted all that. Ms. Jackow states, in my mind, if I'm voting, for anything, I'm voting on a ballot, and it says this, and this and this; I'm voting on the language on the ballot; not what what's going to happen after that. Commissioner Cook states I understand, but as a homeowner, it was still going to be \$587. Ms. Jackow states and I understand that. Commissioner Hansen states and we as a Board we had to put it in that way. This is what you're voting on, this is your max, this is what the max is on everything. After that, we couldn't even talk about what we'd do with those things until after that vote. Chief Nisbet states honestly, the only reason why, and I don't mean this with any disrespect, the only reason we had to go to a vote on this is because we are an independent special taxing district. If we had been in a County government, dependent district, or if we'd have been a city government, we could have just done it. Commissioner Hansen states like City of Cape Coral just put an assessment on their people, they didn't have a choice. Here's your fire assessment. Ms. Jackow states the people didn't vote on it, the Council voted on it. Commissioner Griffin states that's our point, that's what we're saying, they didn't have to. DVP Lemieux states that's the way that bill is written. Chief Nisbet states that actually being an independent district gave the community, and they actually spoke very loudly, the option. DVP Lemieux states that actually if we had ever assessed anything in this District ever, we could have just imposed it. Ms. Jackow states she doesn't know if that's a possibility, if you're going to do something again in November, to leave this millage alone and to come up with a flat assessment to add on to that. Commissioner Cook states I don't like that; to me that's not fair. I would be opposed to that. DVP Lemieux asks what happens if it's more money? Commissioner Cook states I don't care if it's less, I would be opposed to it. DVP Lemieux asks again, but what if it's more money per individual? Ms. Jackow states but it would be, but it would be on a more fair basis of somebody paying... Commissioner Cook states but it's not fair, to me, in my opinion, fair is everybody pays the same. You keep saying fair, but to me, that's not fair when one person pays more than the other person. Ms. Jackow states well when everything else on your tax bill is based on what your property is assessed. Commissioner Cook states that's not true; when you pay the garbage bill... Ms. Jackow states for the school tax, for the federal, for the state for the school, the library; the mosquito control... Commissioner Cook asks you think that's a great system they've got going there? Ms. Jackow defend that's how it all operates... Commissioner Cook states he understands, but just because it does; we are trying to change the way you see it now. The way you pay the taxes; we're trying to make

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

it fair. Capt. Brunson states just because the system is broken. Commissioner Cook continues wouldn't you much rather budget your money knowing what you're going to pay next year? Right now you don't have a clue what you're paying next year. You know what you're paying next year, but you don't have a clue what you're paying the year after that. You don't have a clue what you're going to be paying for fire board. You know what I mean? You don't have any idea. We're telling you that you will know exactly what you're going to pay for the next five years. Ms. Jackow states we're trying to come up with other ideas... Commissioner Cook continues it's a good way to do your budget...it's a good way for us to do our budget. We have to have a five year plan. How can we do a five year plan? We don't know what's going to happen. We don't know what's going to happen next year. Mr. Brodtkin states that Debbie's proposal is that everyone would pay a little bit more as opposed to some people paying more and some people paying less. Commissioner Cook asks why you would care what some people are doing anyway. Why don't you worry about what you're paying. Mr. Brodtkin states because you're putting a big hit...Ms. Jackow states because I'm not looking at it for myself; I'm looking at it for people who are paying less than a hundred dollars because they have a little trailer and in a park...Commissioner Cook states it doesn't matter what they have, we're still sending the guys there. People are still going there. Ms. Jackow states it does matter to them when their taxes more than double because of this and then they lose their tax certificates and then they lose their dwelling and that's all they have and all they live on is social security. I'm not looking at it, I said from the beginning, I'd be willing, if mine goes up... Commissioner Cook states we are helping them, we're giving them a fixed rate. Ms. Jackow says that's not helping them it's kicking them out of their home. That's not helping them. Commissioner Cook says how about we agree to disagree? Ms. Jackow states when you see how many tax certificates are going up for sale and where they're going up for sale at; which I did, and they can't afford to pay what they have now, if they double your taxes because of this, you're basically kicking them out of their house. Chief Nisbet asks, Debbie how many properties was that, that were paying like \$50? She replies I'd have to count them. Chief recalls it as being less than a hundred. She says it's a lot of them off Palm Creek. Chief agrees, Palm Creek Dr. was the area he really saw. She replies most of the areas, there are very few, I highlighted them all; I could come up with percentages for you, but since I thought this was basically already set in stone for November, I didn't bring them in, but I mean most people were paying more. A majority were paying more; there was no 50%, 49%; that was totally not factual. Chief states that was the information he had at the time; just the rough math. She responds it's probably eighty-some percent paying more, now that depends how you're going to handle the agricultural portion of it; and that makes a big difference. That makes a huge difference; well if you're gonna go per parcel, you're going to get a lot more money than if you say ok, we're going to charge you once for all your parcels. And according to the way this was written, it's an open ended part on a ballot. Ms. Marth asks if we have to use the same verbiage in November or can it be changed? Can we see about tweaking it a little to make it clearer? Chief Nisbet states it will be up to the elections office, because the Board did pass a resolution; if we can put per parcel on it and take the question mark out; I will look into it. Ms. Jackow continues, and I feel if you have explosives and you have things that can really cause a massive fire; they shouldn't be paying less, and they're all paying less. Commissioner Cook states with all due respect, I really think it did not pass, not because of that, but because it was \$587. That's the only reason. We could change the verbiage, but if it stays at \$587, it's probably still not going to

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

pass. Ms. Jackow states I understand that, I'm just bringing up different points. Commissioner Cook states It also doesn't change the fact that we're losing six guys in September. None of that changes. Captain Brunson states 68 days. Ms. Jackow states what I'm trying to get at eventually here, if you can change the verbiage to a place where people would actually vote for this, and we could as a community, somehow come together to figure out how to float these people from September to November... Commissioner Cook states, there's no way. We don't have the money. If we had the money we would; we've floated them for six years. Ms. Kamener states I read in the minutes that you asked for a loan. Do you have a loan? Commissioner Cook states it is just for bills. Chief Nisbet and Commissioner Hansen both state it is just to pay bills from October until November or December when our tax roll starts coming in. Chief states it is less expensive than a tax anticipation loan. Commissioner Cook states our budget starts in October, but we don't have money coming in until November or December. Ms. Marth states that's stupid. Commissioner Cook states it depends on when you pay your taxes, do you pay them in October or March? Ms. Kamener asks if it's not spread out over a year. Chief Nisbet states, oh no. Ms. Kamener states the system is totally (inaudible comment as at this moment many loud vocals are heard in recording). Commissioner Hansen states the entire ad valorem system is a mess, in every realm, Commissioner Cook does respond, now you understand; and that's what we are trying to change. Ms Kamener states you know, you look at the homeowner that went berserk during the boom and refinanced or bought a house they couldn't afford, but you just automatically think that the government and the banks and everybody else is doing something responsible but they're not. Commissioner Cook states and that hurt us, which as a Board, it killed us. I mean you see what happened. And like I say, when it when up, we weren't like some people that just kept bringing in the money, and built, what did we do here...Chief Nisbet states our boom year was 25%. Ms. Marth asks when our verbiage is due for the election in November. Chief Nisbet responds, it was already due. She asks if we put in for the same thing we already tried. Chief Nisbet responds that we did per Board direction. She asks if we have to pay for another election. Chief responds we do not since it is a general election. (There are other conversations going on at this time) Commissioner Cook is heard to say he does like this kind of meeting where we are actually kind of talking and not throwing accusations. Commissioner Hansen states to Ms. Marth, and Ms. Jackow, we will see if we can get an answer to their requests (regarding ballot language changes), and it won't be a percentage, it will be equal amounts. Chief Nisbet asks Vice Chairman Griffin is he could have a couple seconds... permission granted he states a lot of people had a chance to discuss here tonight, and it's very passionate, I will tell you like Billy said, what were the days again, (DVP Lemieux responds 68 days) in 68 days I'm going to try to figure something out to keep these six guys working, they mean that much to me... I want to make sure this community is protected, that's all I'm trying to do, and I tried to give honest information and try to make sure it's accurate information, I don't intentionally lie to people, I don't lie to people, period, I'm an honest person, and I want to be able to help out in situations, I want to be able to help the residents, and it's like you said, we are running a business; if I can't keep them, I've got to figure out how to get them back. That's going to be my next step. And then I also have to make sure that I can keep at least the six guys that are still sitting here protected; so that we can go out in the community and do what we've got to do. And it sucks, you know, we didn't want to get here. I've looked at the budget just now as I'm getting ready to go, I have nowhere else to cut, besides personnel.

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

None what-so-ever. And we've cut over \$500,000 out of operation expenses in the last 8 years. And we are looking at a \$2M shortfall. I thought we'd be coming out of this by now, I know everybody here did, but it's frustrating, I want to be there for what anybody might need. I don't tell anybody no, but what sucks is I'm going to get struck having to say no because I'm not going to have the resources, the employees to do so. And I appreciate Debbie and Steve and Karen coming in, and I apologize again for the unfortunate meeting minutes, we're very transparent, that's evident, but, I live here too. I want to make sure we get it taken care of. Commissioner Griffin states I, myself feel the same way, we've been working on it and trying, I mean it's all of us, it's not y'all and us, and this and that, we are all in this together... Commissioner Cook states I hope we are. Ms. Jackow asks if that is the only plan that GSG has for every place that they present to, like Lehigh and North Fort Myers. Chief Nisbet states it is the only one that has stood up through Supreme Court challenges. Office Manager states it is based on a study of the District and its responses... Commissioner Cook states, yes, it's where we run most of our calls and they did quite a bit of research on it. DVP Lemieux states, understand that we don't run a lot of calls to the people who pay \$8,000 a year in fire tax. Commissioner Cook states actually, we don't run any calls to them. That's another thing I wanted to bring up to some people, the people that have those homes usually are pretty well protected with fire sprinklers and everything else, they don't run calls to those houses, and they pay the most. Commissioner Griffin states but it's not just about fires. Commissioner Cook states he means about anything... Commissioner Griffin states the way I look at it is with the day and age, fire protection is, as you said, more advanced, there's more knowledge on it, it's medical problems, EMS problems, it's a higher issue throughout the United States, then fires. Ms. Jackow asks so when EMS goes out, what do you take out; a specialized pickup? Chief Nisbet responds we send a small pumper or our brush truck; and the reason we do that is because it never fails, if we get one, we get two. It just happened to us the other day; we had a fire alarm activation at Baypointe that we were handling and we had a wreck with entrapment on I-75 and we actually had to have Tice come out and help us with that. Mr. Jorgensen asks Chief if we have paramedics that work at Bayshore. Chief Nisbet responds that we have a few, but we are not credentialed. Mr. Jorgensen asks but are they on the trucks? Chief responds yes, we have 3 right now... DVP Lemieux notes that unfortunately they are in the bottom six. Chief Nisbet agrees, he will still be here, but the others we're losing. I'm always looking at areas of cost and to keep costs down, and the rescue we had out here initially didn't have water on it and there was a couple times the crews got caught out there without water. Ms. Marth states that scares her. So if this does indeed happen; DVP Lemieux states it is happening, it's happening in 68 days. She turns to him and assures we are going to do what we can; and continues, if it happens, we won't have any EMTs at this station, she asks. Chief Nisbet responds, oh no, everybody else is EMTs, but the two firefighters that I have are paramedics, and we don't provide ALS service, but they have a higher level of training, though two of the paramedics will be gone. Ms. Jackow states, but you can't transport, you have to stay there. Chief agrees; we cannot transport. Commissioner Griffin adds that we were hoping, one day to be able to provide that service as well... Chief Nisbet states that his original five year plan we were going to have a paramedic on our engine company by now. Captain Brunson states that those people did so to protect their community better, it was not done for any financial gain, the very minute bit of money they get paid doesn't come close to what it costs them... Chief Nisbet states he gives them \$500 a year for that and it costs \$4,000 to become a paramedic.

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

Commissioner Griffin states the cost to have an ambulance or two to do that would run us in the hole, because even though EMS charges, it doesn't compensate. It's the same as Lehigh, who has a couple of ambulances out there, now as far as us going ALS, we'd have paramedics that would have the drugs and the ability to do basically everything that EMS does now, except that they can't transport. Ms. Kamener asks if she can say one more thing to try and explain the point she was trying to make before, she continues, because I guess, I get..I don't like going to these meetings when there's more than like five people in the room, my blood pressure goes up, my heart starts racing, I've tried a million things to control it, it's never going to work, it's just the way I am...ok, Route 31, if they're going to do Babcock, and if they had done North River Village, they need to raise Route 31, they are supposed to raise it six inches, but when I talked to the engineers at DOT, they were like, well they're going to raise it at least six inches, it might be a foot. One of the guys from County Planning confirmed to her that for every inch that they raise 31 we're going to have another inch of sheet flow. So, she continues, we followed the Babcock permit because what they want to do is up by Cook & Brown Rd. where there's half a mile of water, 3-6 inches deep, flows across it for days, sometimes for weeks, Babcock wants to put a utility site berm, 4' high and from North to south it's 6/10 of a mile, that's going to send all that water straight down 31, so our group, me individually because I got into an argument with Kitson's secretary, Debbie wouldn't let me file with the group, I had to file alone, and my petition for administrative hearing was accepted by water management, and so I got an A in law for that meeting. So, we filed the petitions, Lee County filed one, various other people filed petitions for administrative hearing against that utility site. They eventually withdrew that application, and they put the utility site in with the main development; and then they came up with the plan to put massive culverts under 31 and to put that water in a canal, a four mile canal, 40' wide and about 13' deep, and so that was the fix for all that water going across 31 instead of sending it down 31 which I think would have negatively impacted your lives a lot with all the accidents. So anyway, Babcock recently applied for an environmental resource permit modification. They want to eliminate the conveyance and what they want to replace this four mile canal with is a little ditch that goes from 31 over to the mine and they want to put the water in the mine, and the ditch is only going to be 2 1/2' deep and five feet wide. And I've got a RT 31 flooding study that was done by DOT and those mines are already up to capacity, there's no way you can fit water in there. And anyway; the head of water management was ready to sign off on it. He told Steve and I that all they had to do was pay their fee. And I said but Dan, they want to remove the conveyance. And he said "well that's not what the Engineer told me". So, we had met with them and the Division of Natural Resources, the heads to discuss this, and nobody had read their e-mail and it was only a page and a 1/4, of the proposed and the existing conditions. So, I sent it back out to them and then Dan told me that as far as water management was concerned, they're not going to sign off on it. They could not eliminate that conveyance. And so that is why I follow this stuff, and it's not just for me, it's for everyone, because it's the right thing to do. You know, to have these developers deal with the negative impacts of their development and to not wreak havoc in our society. So you know, and that's why, whether you approve of the development or not, you should still come to some of these meetings sometimes and say "Hey, we want them to dump it in the canal; they can't just dump water down 31". You know, you are the one who is responsible for our safety, so that's why I was upset, because you're supporting these developers that have lied to us, they sneak; they try to get away with what I just mentioned. That's why,

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

we, you know what I mean? We want to know that you really care about us. Commissioner Griffin states I guess it's how you look at; we're looking at the tax revenue that we're going to get from it, I don't think anybody here wants a negative impact, from any of them, as far as what you're saying, but if we support anything, it's just the tax dollars that we're going to get to keep this Department open and going, to protect everybody's lives. Chief Nisbet states, Commissioners I am aware too of this Babcock conveyance thing because I remember a meeting I was at, and I have to apologize because I had intended to write a letter, but with everything going on with the assessment, we hadn't done it, so...if that still needs to be done...we are against exasperating that sheet flow, because of that conveyance not going through, I'll be more than happy to write a letter on that. Ms. Jackow states is what you don't realize is if you don't follow these things from the beginning, it's like a series on TV, you can't jump in on season two without knowing what happened in season one, same thing with all these other things we follow, if you weren't there from the get go and heard all the promises made, you would never pick up on all the things they try to get away with. And this is what Karen and Steve, more than I, do, because I work the hours I work during the week, but if, you have to, and unfortunately it's really sad with the County because the one group doesn't know what the other one's doing. And they'll rubber stamp anything to death until you point out, no, no...this is what it says back here, and Karen pulls out documents that are several inches thick and points out, this is what they promised us. And then it's oh yeah, they did promise us that, did they give us that, and no they didn't do that...and we're like the watchdogs of these people because if not, they'll get away with murder because the people that don't do their homework that are being paid by the County or by the State to do their homework, and they don't do it. Ms. Kamener states the original developers of Stoneybrook they put in that  $\frac{3}{4}$ , well Dick Pritchett put in the  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile berm. And that was added to his AG permit. He applied for an AG, wait, no; he applied to do the road with water management and then he put in the AG permit for the berm. And that  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile berm goes from Bayshore to Popash Creek. And it cuts off, if you look at the 1966 aerials, it cuts off a big flow way. And after '95 we started flooding like crazy, you know, even more. I mean to the point where the water's flowing over the roads a lot more. That was the first time I called the fire department and said when do I need to be worried? We've got 3-4" of water on the road now in front of my house and I've lived here since 1984, and I said do I need to be worried about evacuating? And that's when they came down the road and looked, but after that I learned exactly what's going on. Vice Chairman Griffin excuses, and says I don't want to cut you off, and I understand your concern, we all do, but this really isn't the meeting to discuss all this... Chief Nisbet asks if he can suggest we take a quick break, because we have another meeting, and we have to get that done too. Vice Chairman Griffin says that's fine, and he offers Ms. Marth her opportunity to speak briefly. She states I think that what you guys are proposing and saying is awesome, but the \$100 a month they get; if we ask too much of them, we are not going to get the quality where we need it. I think if you guys continue doing what you're doing (she's speaking to the CCB) and they have open ears (she refers to the fire board)..., Ms. Kamener speaks again, that's why I asked for their e-mails so that I could start sending them some of the stuff so they know what we're doing so that they know that we're not crazy and that we're not a joke. Ms. Marth states I just think to expect them to do all of this is unfortunately not going to happen because there's only so many hours in the day, but I think if they can count on certain residents who can do it the right way and attend these meetings and represent our community and bring it back, then that's the way to do

BAYSHORE FIRE PROTECTION & RESCUE SERVICE DISTRICT  
MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

July 8, 2014

this. Chief Nisbet states he will do what he can, but for the next 63 days I have one priority. Commissioner Cook states his agreement, yea, right now, it is kind of one thought with that. Ms. Marth agrees that that is where Chief's priorities need to be, and states and you guys just keep doing your good work, and give it to them and if you have a problem with him (referring to Chief), let me know...Ms. Jackow asks how long do have to tweak that language? Commissioner Griffin states we have to check if we even can. Chief states we will check with Bernie Feliciano tomorrow and see if we can do that. Commissioner Cook states we also need to talk to the company that did our research and see how much we can change. Commissioner Griffin states there's a lot of legal issues, I mean it had to go through, it's not like we just made it up. Commissioner Cook states it's not going to help us with anything if we have \$70,000 to \$80,000 a year in attorney fees either, that doesn't help us much. So we have to make sure everything's right. Ms. Jackow states you have to hire that group to adjust all those people's rates that are too high based on not knowing what we're really taxing them. Commissioner Cook agrees, but states, but we don't want to get into where we are fighting people all the time. Ms. Jackow states I am just trying to figure out a way that you can tweak something to get a better plan in for November ; somehow hold them over from September to November, and that's something that people would go for. Vice Chairman Griffin asks Chief how long of a recess he needs. Chief states 10 minutes. Vice Chairman Griffin calls for a 10 minute break to be followed immediately by an executive session. 8:56pm

**Recess** – 8:56pm

**Executive Session (Pre-Contract Negotiation)**

**Reconvene** – 9:22pm

**Public Input** - Hearing none Vice-Chairman Griffin calls for Motion to Adjourn

**Motion to Adjourn** – Motion to adjourn made by Commissioner Cook and seconded by Commissioner Klos. With none opposed, meeting adjourned 9:23pm.